Work product of the Gridwise Architecture Council (GWAC) Transactive Energy Workshop

Presented to the Gridwise Architecture Council Workshop on the

State of Transactive Energy

October 31, 2012

Edward G. Cazalet

CEO - TeMix Inc.

www.temix.com

ed@temix.com

Transactive Energy US Road Map Stages

Expansion 2013-2020

 Deployments of Transactive Energy on portions of the grid where value is high, and there is regulatory and participant support.

Hybrid 2015-2030

 Widespread deployment of Transactive Energy within some regions with interfaces to existing operations and markets as needed.

Mature 2020-2050

 Near full deployment of Transactive Energy within many regions.

Draft work product of the Gridwise Architecture Council (GWAC) Transactive Energy Workshop www.gridwiseac.org

Introduction 2011-2015

 Development of Transactive Energy vision, standards and pilot demonstrations.

GWAC 10/31/2012

Transactive Energy Road Map Tracks

Grid Services

•Retail Service

- Distribution Service
- •ISO/RTO, Other Transmission & Balancing Operator Services
- •Wholesale Forward Energy and Transport Services
- •Grid Custodian Services

Transactive Support Functions

- •Adequacy and Reliability
- •Ancillary Services
- Standards
- •Uniform Transaction and Delivery Intervals
- Scheduling
- •Uniform Settlement
- •Clearing, Pricing and Coordination Algorithms
- •Device and System Management Algorithms

Grid Participants

- •Distributed Generation
- •Grid Generation
- •Renewables
- •Customers
- •Plug-in Electric Vehicles
- Storage
- •Micromarkets and Microgrids
- Intermediaries

Environment

GWAC 10/31/201

10/10/2012

1	Α	В	С	D	E	F
1	Overview	Vision	each region evolve at different paces, updated as necessary. In a mature transactive grid, optimizat comprise the grid. Coordination is larg micro-transactions for both Energy an Energy products. Energy products als Transactions are generally asynchron positions. Any party can transact with operators and balancing entities. In a mature transactive grid, grid cust security, system operating limits, relia	hence the overlapping ranges of dates ion and control is largely decentralized gely through forward tenders and trans d Transport (T&D) products when clos o include Reserve products that are co ous and mostly forward of delivery with any other party including intermediaries todians such as today's federal, state a bility and grid standards and collect, and s evolve through more customer particit t power. Coordination of changes in re- naring of the cost and benefits among pa- on, storage and energy using devices a bids and offers) for energy and transpo- orage and smart devices, the balancin les. Transactions can be designated as within system operating limits. Financo- th in cost-of-service franchise markets	s for each stage in the roadmap. The land is associated with the parties, de sactions and automated processing of e to delivery. Energy products can be ontingency options that may be exercise in ex-post transactions for differences b es. System operating reliability limits a and local regulatory agencies and grid halyze and publish information on syste pation in the markets, more distributed etail, distribution, transmission and who structing environmental commodities a arties by explicit subsidies and taxes. and systems are self-managed in respondent port products among the parties. In a gri g of supply and demand using Transac is either financial or physical. Physical t ial transactions are forward hedges se	vices and systems that use and micro-tenders (buy or sell offers) and both Real Energy and Reactive ed for operating reliability. etween metered delivery and forward re honored by Transport (T&D) operators enforce market rules, grid em operating limits and capabilities to I generation, transitions to competitive olesale markets will be necessary. such as renewable and carbon onse to near continuously updated id with increasing penetration of ctive Energy can efficiently ransactions are intended to schedule ttled against physical delivery prices.
2		Benefits The benefits of Transactive Energy accrue to society at large. The benefits result from efficiency gains in investment, operation and consumption innovation through markets. Consumers benefit from the lower costs and the use of automation to manage electricity usage and further reduce of Producers, wires owners and intermediaries benefit by transparent, stable long-term revenues and spot market revenues for their products to sup investment recovery and profits.				
3			Stage 1	Stage 2	Stage 3	Stage 4
4		Dates	2011-2015	2013-2020	2015-2030	2020-2050
5		Stages	Transactive Energy Introduction	Transactive Energy Expansion	Hybrid Transactive Energy Grid	Mature Transactive Energy Grid
6		Scope	Development of Transactive Energy vision, standards and pilot demonstrations of Its benefits and costs.	Deployments of Transactive Energy on portions of the grid where value is high, and there is regulatory and participant support.	Widespread deployment of Transactive Energy within some regions with interfaces to existing operations and markets as needed.	Near full deployment of Transactive Energy within many regions.

	Α	В	С	D	E	F			
3			Stage 1	Stage 2	Stage 3	Stage 4			
4		Dates	2011-2015	2013-2020	2015-2030	2020-2050			
5		Stages	Transactive Energy Introduction	Transactive Energy Expansion	Hybrid Transactive Energy Grid	Mature Transactive Energy Grid			
7 Time-based measurement using of physical electricity usage and production using interval meters is critical to i Larger generators and most industrial and larger commercial customers have interval metering. As indicated b have interval meters. So called "Smart Meters" combine interval metering with two-way communication channel on-board intelligence. Transactive Energy may employ but not require such smart meter communications as of both one-way and two way and broadcast may also be employed using multiple interfaces, communications and						w, residential customers increasingly ith the distribution operator and some wired and wireless communication, evice and cloud-based intelligence.			
8			(End 2012: 16 states at 100%) 33%	50%	75%	95%			
9	Grid Services		retail service. Transactive Energy ma Transactive Energy can apply to bund costs which in some regions are much for blocks of energy (subscriptions) at acquired that specifies the net subscri price any subscribed energy not used responsiveness with a contracted bas forward and spot transactions to mini	The increasing adoption of (1) residential and commercial interval meters, (2) the internet, and (3) device automation lays the foundation for transactive retail service. Transactive Energy may apply to both regulated cost-of-service retailers and competitive retailers where local regulatory policy allows. Transactive Energy can apply to bundled or unbundled energy, transport and other services. Retail transactions must recover both variable and fixed costs which in some regions are much larger than variable costs. Transactive Energy provides actionable forward buy and sell tenders by the retailer for blocks of energy (subscriptions) at tendered fixed prices. Based on the tenders and automation a forward portfolio of energy purchases and sales is acquired that specifies the net subscribed energy in each metered time interval. Based on the meter readings the customer sells at a tendered spot price any subscribed energy not used and buys for any excess energy used at a tendered spot price. Transactive Energy service thus provides price responsiveness with a contracted baseline that provides forward hedging and bill protection. And retail transactions can be better aligned with wholesale forward and spot transactions to minimize retailer risk exposure. With automation and simple customer interfaces the customer experience and be enhanced while saving money and improving quality of service.					
10			Co-evistence of transactive rates	renewables. Demonstration of transactive retail electricity	Transactive service common in both competitive and cost of service markets. Development of transactive retail electricity exchanges.	Competitive transactive retail energy markets, micro markets and microgrids. Further evolution of transactive retail electricity exchanges.			

	Α	В	С	D	E	F	
3			Stage 1	Stage 2	Stage 3	Stage 4	
4		Dates	2011-2015	2013-2020	2015-2030	2020-2050	
5] [Stages	Transactive Energy Introduction	Transactive Energy Expansion	Hybrid Transactive Energy Grid	Mature Transactive Energy Grid	
11		Distribution	other generation, storage, PEV, powe usage of the distribution grid declines	er electronics, micro grids and net-zero and the volatility of flows on the distrik vard reservations and options to use dis	two-way flows and increasing complex energy buildings. And as customers b bution grid increases. This roadmap als stribution capability and dynamic price	ecome more self-sufficient the net o envisions a transition to transactive	
12			Distribution grids with high penetration of renewables and self- generation begin to investigate Transactive Energy distribution service.	Distribution grids with high penetration of renewables and self- generation implement transactive distribution rates.	Wide spread use of transactive distribution rates for distribution grids with high penetration of renewables and self-generation.	Wide spread use of transactive distribution rates.	
13	Grid Services	ISO/RTO, Other Iso a transitional technology while their retail markets are still lergely been diver plants as counterparties rather than two-way transactive interactions with other particip					
14			forward prices for 5-min and hourly Intervals based on existing software. Other balancing entities begin to offer forward actionable and indicative 5-min tenders for energy and transport.	Move toward single part tenders to balancing operators by participants and actionable forward small tenders to participants by balancing operators.	More frequent clearing of single part single part tenders and publication of actionable forward tenders.	Near continuously transacted forward single part tenders for transmission and energy passed to customers and generators.	

	Α	В	С	D	E	F			
3			Stage 1	Stage 2	Stage 3	Stage 4			
4		Dates	2011-2015	2013-2020	2015-2030	2020-2050			
5		Stages	Transactive Energy Introduction	Transactive Energy Expansion	Hybrid Transactive Energy Grid	Mature Transactive Energy Grid			
15		Wholesale Forward Energy	energy and capacity markets provide	retailers and customers with the oppor	ctive Energy markets. Forward generat tunity enter into transactions for energ financial contracts settled against price	y and transport to meet their			
16		and Transport Services	No change.	Wholesale and retail markets better align products with needs of both markets.	Wholesale market better align products to meet retail exchange product needs and standards.	Transactive Energy wholesale products and standards fully aligned with Transactive Energy retail products and standards.			
17	Grid Se	Grid Custodian Services	Authorities, Public Utility Commission	his roadmap envisions a continuing and evolving role for today's grid custodians including FERC, NERC, Regional Reliability Coordinators, Balancing uthorities, Public Utility Commissions and Municipal Boards. We use the generic term Grid Custodian because the reliability and regulatory institution hay evolve over time and because microgrids, for example, may have their own Grid Custodians for some functions.					
18			Study of transactive methods by grid custodians and planning for pilots and early deployments.	Custodians facilitate the roadmap.	Custodians actively support the roadmap.	Custodians are fully supportive of the transactive grid.			

	A	В	С	D	E	F
3			Stage 1	Stage 2	Stage 3	Stage 4
4		Dates	2011-2015	2013-2020	2015-2030	2020-2050
5		Stages	Transactive Energy Introduction	Transactive Energy Expansion	Hybrid Transactive Energy Grid	Mature Transactive Energy Grid
19			transition to more customer self-deter of adequacy. NERC definitions of reli Reliability. (www.nerc.com/docs/pc/De	mination of supply / demand adequacy ability and adequacy for the bulk powe	ndards to accommodate Transactive E / with the customer bearing the consec er system have been evolving to the co /C-PC-mtgs.pdf). This concept appears o purchase.	uences of inadequacy and the costs ncept of an "Adequate Level of
20	ctive Support Functions	Adequacy and Reliability	an energy-only market relies on price to support some self-determination of adequacy. In many states renewable portfolio standards, loading orders impact adequacy. And	deployment of smart thermostats and appliances and building management systems make centralized adequacy planning more difficult and risky because of potential over or under procurement. Implementation of transactive price responsive retail rates spreads to	Widespread deployment of transactive customer rates where the prices of forward tenders guide forward purchases and investments and potentially volatile near-real-time tender prices assure real-time supply demand balance.	Adequacy is largely a matter of customer choice assured by forward transactions and spot prices allowed to reflect market surpluses and shortages. Reliability, grid protection and security remains under the control of Grid Custodians such as reliability coordinators. Customers with self-generation, microgrids, and smart devices and smart buildings have more direct control over their own adequacy.
21	Transac	Ancillary Services	services. Such ancillary transactive s second intervals. Transactive call and contingency reserves from generation real energy (W) to parties with 4-quad	ervices would be carried out using tran d put options with various notification le storage, and end use automated res lrant power conversion devices will mo	uch as secondary frequency regulation isactive options and tenders and trans ead times, strike prices and reservatior ponse. And tenders and transactions for inetize investment in such devices and	actions on 5-minute and 4- to 6- n premiums will evolve to provide or reactive energy (VAR) alongside support local voltage. Several ancillary services
22			Almost all ancillary services purchased and dispatched by central operators and charged to loads.	Transactive price responsive demand begin to provide 5-minute load following services	Transactive call and put options to customers and devices begin to provide contingency reserves.	embedded in transactive real and reactive energy option transactions and paid for by those who use the services.

	Α	В	С	D	E	F
3			Stage 1	Stage 2	Stage 3	Stage 4
4		Dates	2011-2015	2013-2020	2015-2030	2020-2050
5		Stages	Transactive Energy Introduction	Transactive Energy Expansion	Hybrid Transactive Energy Grid	Mature Transactive Energy Grid
23		Standards	Transactive Energy standards addres standards in the GWAC stack. OASIS eMIX/Energy Interop TeMix Profile entered into SGIP Catalog of	s the informational and policy standard	ls in the GWAC stack. Transactive En	ergy builds on the technical
24	ctions		Standards. Tenders, Transactions are based on fixed rate of delivery over intervals.	Transactive Energy operational requirements within IEC and IEEE standards	US and international Transactive Energy standards begin to converge.	Global Transactive Energy standards aligned with other global power industry standards.
25 C T C C C C C C C C C C C C C C C C C					5-minutes: (2) must be nested so that s d account for summer time rules, leap for delivery and settlement must be on	shorter duration intervals nest within years, and leap seconds. All uniform intervals such as an hour, 5-
26	Sup		Generally there are already standard intervals for wholesale transactions.	Continue to align retail intervals with wholesale intervals.	Extend retail to shorter intervals where needed.	Standardization of intervals is widely accepted.
27	Transactive	Scheduling	RTOs and financial transmission right interchange schedules are submitted generation and load schedules. Trans Transactive Energy uses point-to-poir available by Transport service provide	s can be purchased and sold to hedge to transmission operators and owners active Energy schedules are determin nt Transport (T&D) products or services	al-time dispatches. No transmission so congestion costs. Outside of and betw hip or purchase of transmission rights ed by physical transactions among par s (obligations or options) that satisfy gr he distribution grid, point-to-point trans ng of real-time congestion costs.	veen RTOs, generation, load, and is necessary to support the ties at points of injection and takeout. id security constraints and are made
28			Transactive Energy scheduling piloted on distribution and transmission grids. Increasing granularity of scheduling outside of ISO/RTOS.	Path based scheduling entities begin to adopt Transactive Energy scheduling and point-to-point transport products.	Some regions implement Transactive Energy scheduling	Widespread use of Transactive Energy scheduling.

	A	В	С	D	E	F			
3			Stage 1	Stage 2	Stage 3	Stage 4			
4		Dates	2011-2015	2013-2020	2015-2030	2020-2050			
5		Stages	Transactive Energy Introduction	Transactive Energy Expansion	Hybrid Transactive Energy Grid	Mature Transactive Energy Grid			
29		Uniform Settlement	transactions on uniform nested interva total rate of delivery, positive or negat settlement is based on a sequence of envisions near immediate settlement	he roadmap envisions uniform settlement systems across the entire grid. For physical transactions, settlement is based on a sequence of forward ansactions on uniform nested intervals that specifies the total rate of delivery in each metered settlement interval. The difference between the forward tal rate of delivery, positive or negative is settled by a transaction at a tendered price for the metered settlement interval. For financial transactions, ettlement is based on a sequence of futures transactions that are financially settled using a delivery price or index of delivery prices. The roadmap nvisions near immediate settlement publication and frequent payments. Credit, collateral, or pre-payment would typically be required by pounterparties and exchanges and facilitated by uniform settlement systems and rules.					
30	ns		Uniform settlement proposals.	Uniform settlement partial implementations.	Some regions implements uniform settlements.	Wide spread use of uniform settlement rules.			
31	unctior	This roadmap envisions the development and deployment of automated algorithms initiating forward and real-time tenders to coordinate the decentralized optimization of devices and systems on the grid. These algorithms are used by the parties to assure that the operations on the grid observe all grid energy, voltage and other constraints. The details of such algorithms are beyond the scope of this roadmap. However, one issue							
32	upport F	and Coordination Algorithms	No deployed Transactive Energy clearing systems. Pilot single price clearing at wholesale and indicative forward prices.	Publication of forward indicative clearing prices. Early publications of forward actionable tenders to retailers.	Single price clearing at wholesale; Bid/ask clearing at retail.	Transaction clearing algorithms with proven stability, convergence and efficiency.			
33	ctive S		that are optimally operated based on t	forward tenders, device constraints, ot	r heating, refrigeration, pumps, thermal her forecasts and owner preferences. ions can be both long-term for investm	The devices may also post forward			
34	ຕ System	System Management	Virtually no deployed Transactive Energy devices. Co-existence with existing voluntary, price-based, and direct load control methods	Increasing local and cloud based self-dispatch based on optimization and heuristic algorithms.	Self-dispatch becomes common.	Devices self-dispatched based on local optimization and forecasting algorithms.			

	Α	В	С	D	E	F	
3			Stage 1	Stage 2	Stage 3	Stage 4	
4		Dates	2011-2015	2013-2020	2015-2030	2020-2050	
5		Stages	Transactive Energy Introduction	Transactive Energy Expansion	Hybrid Transactive Energy Grid	Mature Transactive Energy Grid	
35				d generation(DG) is operated using the both long-term for investment reco			
36	8	Distributed Generation	Low penetration of distributed generation. Begin to plan distributed generation operation based on forward indicative prices.	Higher penetration of distributed generation (20%). Local and cloud based self-dispatch based on optimization and heuristics.	High penetration of distributed generation (50%). Self-dispatch becomes common.	Self-dispatch of distributed generation in response to forward tenders. Distributed generators also originators of forward tenders.	
37			The roadmap envisions that grid gene	eration is operated using the same tend	ders and type of algorithms as for gene	eric devices above.	
38	rticipants	Grid Generation	Largely centralized generation dispatch.	Centralized generation dispatch in some ISO/RTOs begins to change to single part tenders and more frequent forward dispatch.	Centralized generation and decentralized generation compete based on single part forward tenders and more frequent forward self- dispatch.	Increasingly distributed mix of generation and low load factors on many centralized generators. Self- dispatch of almost all generation in response to forward tenders. Generators also may be originators of forward tenders.	
39	Parti		This roadmap envisions the use of automated processing of micro-tenders and transactions on short-time intervals when close to delivery to support the increasing deep penetration of variable renewables such as wind and solar on the distribution and transmission grid and within microgrids.				
40	Grid		About 20% RPS in some states. Sub hourly transmission scheduling to be required in non-ISO areas.	Higher RPS % (~33%) in some states ; sub hourly transmission scheduling and deployment of transactive methods in those states	Deployment of Transactive Energy methods in many regions enables greater penetration of variable renewables.	Automated processing of micro- transactions on short-time intervals support deep penetration of variable renewables.	
41	2 A		lighting, buildings, HVAC, machines, a response to retail tenders. The roadn	y end-use customers (residential, com and controllers. Smart device controlle nap also envisions a transition to more some cases the use of customer micro ervices roadmap track above.	rs may be hosted at the device, on-site on-site generation using PV, CHP, fue	e, or by cloud service providers in I cells and the use of on-site	
42			Customers primarily on flat or TOU full requirements rates combined with event-based demand response programs settled against estimated base lines. Low customer participation and low automation of responses.	Customers begin to use automated communicating thermostats and building management systems to respond to price, weather, and occupancy.	Customers move to retail transactive services and further automation of response. Customers with on-site PV and other generation are high penetration adopters of transactive services	Customers buy and sell energy both forward and in real-time based on actionable priced tenders. Automation of device and system response and customer risk management.	

	Α	В	С	D	E	F	
3			Stage 1	Stage 2	Stage 3	Stage 4	
4		Dates	2011-2015	2013-2020	2015-2030	2020-2050	
5		Stages	Transactive Energy Introduction	Transactive Energy Expansion	Hybrid Transactive Energy Grid	Mature Transactive Energy Grid	
43			and at solar and wind farms. Coordin	ated dispatch of storage is achieved u	ocations on the grid in buildings, comm sing transactive micro-tenders and trar arge and discharge limits, storage cap	nsactions and self-optimization of	
44		Storage	Low penetration of storage except pumped hydro.	Storage MW at about 1% of peak usage. Distributed Energy Storage deployment begins at locations with high penetration of PV.	Storage MW at about 5% of peak usage. Customers with on-site storage are high adopters of Transactive Energy services.	Storage MW at about 10% of peak usage. Transactive Energy forward tenders and transactions enable efficient dispatch of grid scale and distributed storage.	
45	ants		the PEV storage is optimally charged forward tenders that reflect conditions	and discharged based on customer pr on the local circuits, the distribution a	nd then charge and discharge capable. eferences and requirements, battery c nd transmission grid and energy supply options (reserves) using transactive me	apability, and warranty in response to y and demand. Services provided by	
46	articipants		Early deployments of charge only PEVs.	Increasing deployments of PEV and charging stations including fast charging stations.	Charge and discharge PEVs emerge.	PEV owners may both charge and discharge optimally to minimize cost and make forward reservations.	
47	Grid P	Micromarkets	This roadmap envisions a transition to a grid with micromarkets within micromarkets and a multi-level structure of transactive markets. Parties may transact with other parties in their local market or in other markets where transport is available and regulations permit. Some micromarkets may be aligned with microgrids that provide local balancing and other services and that can be operated independently of other connected grids, if necessary. One important developing technology is distribution micromarkets and microgrids that coordinate local distribution services, generation and load while allowing operation independently of the main grid when necessary. Such microgrids and micromarkets provide resiliency while still supporting efficient transactions among participants within the micromarket and with other markets.				
48			Demonstration micro markets and microgrids.	More customers install self- generation, storage and controls that can support microgrids. Microgrids become common.		Many microgrids operating transactive micromarkets interacting with other microgrids and micromarkets	
49			This roadmap envisions a continuing and expanding role for intermediaries such as power marketers that provide transaction liquidity, credit, and risk management to support efficient transactions.				
50			Intermediaries provide forward market liquidity and risk management services.	Increasing role of intermediaries to provide transactive wholesale and retail liquidity extending to short duration close to delivery intervals.	Continued increase role of power marketers and other intermediaries as liquidity and risk providers.	Power marketer and other intermediaries expanded role as liquidity, credit and risk management providers.	

Draft work product of the Gridwise Architecture Council (GWAC) Transactive Energy Workshop - www.gridwiseac.org Members please send comments to the GWAC TEW list. Non-members please send comments to ed@temix.com. Provide row/column name for comments.

	Α	В	С	D	E	F
3			Stage 1	Stage 2	Stage 3	Stage 4
4		Dates	2011-2015	2013-2020	2015-2030	2020-2050
5		Stages	Transactive Energy Introduction	Transactive Energy Expansion	Hybrid Transactive Energy Grid	Mature Transactive Energy Grid
51	51 Environment This roadmap envisions both (1) transactions for shares of the actual output of specific generation sources such as wind and solar for environmental certificates such as renewable energy credits (RECs), carbon credits, SOX credits and NOX credits. Generally certificates or commodities are defined by government policy and employ registries to issue and retire credits.					
52		LINNONNER	Icarbon etc. deployed in most US	Increased transactions for environmental commodities.	Transactions for environmental commodities are common.	Transactions for environmental commodity rights widely required.